



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB)

FROM: Serena Bolliger, Historic Preservation Planner
Mical Tawney, Acting Historic Preservation Planner

DATE: November 6, 2023

SUBJECT: CoA 23-22, 2737 23rd Road North, Maywood Local Historic District

Background Information

The *Maywood National Register Nomination* describes the pre-1916 contributing Queen Anne dwelling at 2737 23rd Road North as follows:

The two-bay-wide, wood-frame dwelling is clad in wood shingles and has a front-gable roof with flared eaves, sheathed in asphalt shingles. It has a one-story, four-bay, wood-frame wrap-around front porch on Tuscan columns. Windows are a one-over-one wood sash and one-over-one vinyl-sash, with one-light single-sash in the gable end. Other notable features include wide, overhanging eaves with a beaded soffit, a three-faceted bay window on the west elevation, two gable-roof dormers on the side elevations, and an entry with a four-light transom and two-light sidelights. Also of note is an electrified lamp on a turned wood post. The metal lantern appears to have originally been gas-burning.

In December 2019, the HALRB approved a Certificate of Appropriateness (CoA) for the renovation of a non-historic rear addition to this home with new siding, windows, door, roofing, and A/C units (CoA 19-26). The design also included modification of a non-historic bathroom window and the addition of a doorway in an existing non-historic window penetration in the historic portion of the house. In September 2020, the HALRB approved an amendment (CoA 19-26A) to the original approval for the replacement of two non-historic vinyl windows in the addition with wooden windows.

Proposal

The applicants are requesting to replace thirteen (13) double-hung vinyl windows in the original house with double-hung wooden windows to match the three extant wooden windows. The windows proposed for replacement include:

- Main elevation:

- Two 30½” x 60¾” 1/1 windows on the second story.
- West side elevation:
 - One 30½” x 60¾” 1/1 window at the front of the home;
 - Three 1/1 windows on a bay toward the rear, one measuring 39¼" x 60½ ", and two measuring 23" x 60½"; and
 - A pair of 30½” x 60¾” 1/1 windows on the second story.
- North (rear) elevation:
 - One 30½” x 60¾” 1/1 window on the second story.
- East side elevation:
 - Four 1/1 windows around a bay toward the mid-point of the home, two measuring 31" x 58¼", and two measuring 23" x 58¼".

The applicants plan to install Marvin Signature Ultimate double-hung wood windows and re-use the existing wooden casing where extant, and reproduce matching casing for the east side elevation bay window where the trim is missing.

In addition, the property owners are recipients of a 2023 Arlington County Historic Preservation Fund Grant totaling \$49,250, in which they are required to provide a 100% match. The scope of their grant project includes refurbishing their home’s wrap-around porch, restoring the existing wood windows, and replacing vinyl windows with wood-framed windows. Important aspects of this grant project involve promoting the racial and social equity in the award and execution of the crafts work, and providing information to the community about the history of the house, trolley line, restrictions on sales of homes to specific ethnicities, the construction of I-66, the relocation of homes onto subdivided property, as well as the preservation and repair of their home. Property owners Joseph and Beth Andrews will invite students from Arlington Tech and other similar programs to view the work at various stages, and the community will be able to learn about the project through social media and signage that will be translated into multiple languages.

Design Review Committee (DRC) Review

The DRC considered this CoA application at its November 1, 2023, hybrid meeting. The DRC members had no questions or concerns and placed this item on the Consent Agenda for the November 15, 2023, hybrid HALRB public hearing. Mr. Wenchel asked the applicants if they could find evidence that the windows had ever been 6/6 or 6/1 windows; the applicants agreed to check their research with neighbors.

Staff Recommendation

The Historic Preservation Program (HPP) staff recommends approval of the application as submitted. The proposed windows fulfill the requirements outlined in Appendix H: In-Kind Window Replacement Guidelines of the *Maywood Design Guidelines* as approved by the HALRB in June 2022:

Typical windows: Typical sash configurations in the Maywood Local Historic District [LHD] may include but not be limited to one-over-one, two-over-two,



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

six-over-six, and six-over-one windows; single-pane casement windows; and square single-pane or four-light attic, dormer, and basement windows.

The HALRB will permit in-kind, identical window replacements for typical windows in Maywood. New typical replacement windows must:

- Match the existing windows in material, design, dimension, profile, and appearance from the public right-of-way;
- Fit properly within the existing window openings;
- Replicate the existing pane configuration;
- Replicate the dimensions and profiles of the existing sash, framing elements, and muntins; and
- Match the finish and visual qualities of the existing windows.

If the existing window material is inconsistent with the age and style of the house, the applicant may submit a material more appropriate for the LHD for the HALRB's consideration.

Based on the application, the HPP staff agrees that the proposed "typical" windows comply with Appendix H of the *Design Guidelines*. The applicants currently have vinyl windows in the historic portion of the contributing dwelling, which is a non-historic material given the home's construction date. By replacing vinyl windows with wooden windows, the applicants will be restoring historically appropriate features to their home.

The applicants have three existing 1/1 wooden double-hung windows in the dwelling. The proposed Marvin window design would make the visible glass area in the replacement windows more closely match that of the extant windows, which complies with Standard 6 of *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*:

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Because wooden windows are typical of the period of construction and will match the three extant 1/1 wooden windows in the home, this restoration likewise complies with Standard 3 of *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*:

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.