



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB)
FROM: Mical Tawney, Historic Preservation Associate Planner
DATE: May 5, 2025
SUBJECT: CoA 25-03, 2332 N. Fillmore St., Maywood Local Historic District

Background Information

The 1950, Colonial Revival non-contributing house at 2332 N. Fillmore St. was described in the 2003 *Maywood Register of Historic Places (NRHP) Nomination Form* as follows:

“The three-bay-wide, concrete-block masonry dwelling rests on a solid brick foundation. It is faced with 6:1 Flemish bond, and has a side-gable roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. The one-story, single-bay, flat roof hood over the entry is supported on metal brackets. Windows are 1/1 vinyl-sash, a diamond-paned casements. Other notable features include two front-gable dormers clad in aluminum siding, a raised basement accommodating a below-grade garage, a three-faceted bay window with a copper roof, a Colonial Revival entry surround with fluted pilasters, and rowlock sills. Major alterations include the one-story, gable-roof addition to the north.”

In December 2010, the HALRB approved CoA 10-28 for the partial demolition of the dwelling and the construction of a second story addition and rear addition. The work included raising the existing side-gable roof by 4 feet, constructing a new shed roof over the entryway, raising the existing chimney by 2 feet, and building a brick patio with a wood retaining wall. No changes were made to the existing garage as part of this project. In May 2011, HPP staff approved ACoA 11-12 for the installation of two new AC units at the rear of the property. In June 2011, the HALRB approved CoA 11-25 for the installation of a new metal handrail at the front stoop and the replacement of aluminum siding in the front dormers with Hardiplank. In January 2013, HPP staff approved ACoA 11-01 for the installation of a new generator near the existing AC units at the rear of the house. In September 2017, the HALRB approved CoA 17-21 for the replacement of two metal basement awning windows with two two-lite wood awning windows on the front elevation of the house. In February 2018, the HALRB approved CoA 18-02 for the installation of a metal railing on the north side of the concrete stair leading from the sidewalk to the front yard. In March 2020, HPP staff approved ACoA 20-03 for the construction of a 4' tall wood picket fence with two gates along the front and the side of the property.

Proposal

The applicant is proposing to replace the existing wood garage door with a steel garage door. The attached garage is below-grade and located along the south elevation. The replacement door would measure 8' w. x 7' h. and feature a paneled design with four lites across the top. The applicant is also proposing to replace the existing garage side entrance door, which is wood, with a steel door. The new

door would be half-glazed, measure 30" w. x 80" h., and feature two panels at the bottom with 9 lites at the top.

Design Review Committee (DRC) Review

The Design Review Committee (DRC) considered this application at its May 7, 2025, hybrid meeting. HPP staff provided an overview of the project and reminded the commissioners that the *Maywood Design Guidelines* do not treat non-contributing houses differently than contributing houses. Mr. Wenchel said he did not believe that non-contributing houses should be held to the same standards as contributing buildings and felt that it was appropriate for the garage door and side door to be replaced with steel doors. Mr. Dudka asked the applicant if they had tried to restore the door. Ms. Viswanatha said that the side door was warped and could not close properly and that the garage door was largely inoperable due to the age of the internal mechanism. Mr. Dudka offered that he felt the doors should be made of wood, but that someone could likely fix the existing. Mr. Davis mentioned that there have been other instances in Maywood where the HALRB has allowed the use of modern materials for door replacements due to unfavorable conditions for wood materials (high moisture areas). He said he did not believe this condition was met with this situation based on what was presented and expressed a preference for wood doors. The commissioners believed that the full HALRB should discuss the project and, as such, placed the application on the Discussion Agenda for the May 21, 2025, hybrid HALRB public hearing.

Recommendation

The Historic Preservation Program (HPP) staff recommends denial of the subject application. Staff would prefer that both doors be replaced with wood doors of similar designs to the existing. While the house has non-contributing status in the Maywood Local Historic District, the *Maywood Design Guidelines* apply the same standards to both contributing and non-contributing houses in Maywood. The *Maywood Design Guidelines* do not state that wood doors are required in the district and only notes that the "Repair or replacement of external doors with different materials and/or a different design requires a Certificate of Appropriateness" and that "there are many door types in Maywood that are made up of variations of wood panels and glass panes." (p. 21). However, the use of wood doors is the predominant norm in Maywood and doors comprised of more modern materials have been limited to specific circumstances where the conditions of the area are not favorable for wood materials (CoA 23-13 at 3210 23rd St. N. is a recent example of such an instance). Although Appendix G: Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness in the *Maywood Design Guidelines* addresses detached garages and not attached garages (such as the garage in the subject application), it should be noted that garages with wood doors and wood side doors are considered appropriate and can be approved by HPP staff (pg. G-28).

It is possible that the garage door and side door are original although no concrete evidence was uncovered to definitively prove this point. Photographic evidence suggests that the doors have been in place since at least the early 2000s, and the styling of the doors is in keeping with houses constructed in the mid-20th century. The property's real estate record and house card did not indicate a change had occurred to either door or that the attached garage was added on at a later date. The house has experienced several additions and material changes over the years; however, the attached garage is a prominent feature of the house and both doors are visible from the public right-of-way. HPP staff believe that additional evidence would need to be submitted to justify the use of modern materials due to the presence of unfavorable conditions and the likelihood of another wood door in both locations failing due to those conditions.

It should be noted that a majority of the attached garages in Maywood have wood garage and side doors (CoA 21-28A – 2329 N. Edgewood Street; CoA 15-01A – 2322 N. Fillmore Street; CoA 07-10 – 2900 22nd Street N.; CoA 24-09 – 2725 23rd Rd. N.). Additionally, a majority of the detached garages in



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

Maywood also have wood doors (CoA 19-14 – 3610 22nd Street N.; CoA 20-22 – 3601 21st Ave. N.; CoA 15-26 – 2158 N. Oakland St.; CoA 21-31A – 3421 21st Ave. N.). Only one example of an attached garage with a non-wood door was found at 2206 N. Nelson Street; HPP staff were able to confirm that the door is not wood and is likely a composite material. Although this one example exists, it is not the norm in Maywood.

In summary, HPP staff would prefer the use of wood for both the garage door and the side door. The proposed designs of both doors are appropriate for the district and are close matches to the existing. Specifically, the design of the garage door matches the designs noted on pg. G-34 of the *Maywood Design Guidelines*. However, HPP staff do not find, under the presented circumstances, that the proposed material for the doors is appropriate for the district.