



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB)
FROM: Serena Bolliger, Historic Preservation Planner
DATE: July 10, 2023
SUBJECT: CoA 23-15, 800 S. Buchanan St., Barcroft Community House Local Historic District (LHD)

Background Information

Barcroft Community House is believed to be the only remaining one-room wooden frame schoolhouse in Arlington. The building has served as a church, school, and community meeting place for more than 100 years. It originally was constructed in 1907 to serve as a community building for the Methodist Episcopal Church of Barcroft. Instead, the Arlington School Board leased the building for \$10 per month. In November 1908, the Barcroft School opened with 10 first and second grade students and its first teacher, Miss Beulah Adams.

After the school was relocated to 625 S. Wakefield St. in 1925, the Barcroft Community House continued to serve as a focal point of the community. It has been used as a meeting space for organizations like the Boys Club, Kiwanis Boys Band, Camp Fire Girls, Girl Scouts, Rod and Reel Club, South Arlington A.A.'s and the American Legion. Over the years, it has been used by the Methodist Episcopal Church, Barcroft Union Church, Wolverton Bible Class, New Apostolic Church, and St. Paul's Anglican Episcopal Church. The building became an LHD in 1984 and was listed individually in the National Register of Historic Places in 1995.

The HALRB most recently reviewed this property in October 2007 (CoA 07-37) when the applicants submitted a request to remove a deteriorating Southern Red Oak tree based on the review and approval of the County Urban Forester. The tree was recommended to be replaced with a narrow crown magnolia tree and some redbud trees.

Proposal

The applicant is requesting to replace the existing 3-tab shingle roof with Timberline HDZ architectural shingle roofing by GAF. As the roof is currently a dark grey-green, the applicant would like to retain the grey-green roof coloring.

DRC Review

The Design Review Committee (DRC) considered this application at its July 5, 2023, hybrid meeting. Mr. Davis had no concerns with the proposal. Mr. Wenchel thought that the shadow line of the proposed green shingles was too bold and would detract from the historic character of the building from the right-

of-way. Mr. Dudka suggested selecting a color which would have a less obvious shadow line and also recommended finding photographs of these shingles installed elsewhere as materials often appear different upon installed than in rendered samples. The DRC placed this item on the Discussion Agenda of the July 19, 2023, hybrid HALRB public hearing.

Recommendation

The Historic Preservation Program (HPP) staff recommends approval of the application as submitted. There are no design guidelines for this LHD. The roof material is not listed as a character-defining feature in the *Barcroft Community House National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form*. It is common for 3-tab asphalt shingle roofs, which are particularly two-dimensional and do not reflect the texture that would be expected from natural shingle, to be routinely replaced with architectural shingle roofing in LHDs. The roof was clad in asphalt shingle when the property became an LHD, whereas it had been wooden shingle in 1936 based on the Sanborn Fire Insurance map (sheet 225) and we have record of a permit to re-roof the property in 1951 (Historical House Card, 4/18/51, Permit #6965) Therefore, the existing material is non-historic, and its proposed replacement meets the intent of Standard #9 of *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*:

Standard #9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The County-made sign for the Barcroft neighborhood displays the Barcroft Community House as its symbol for the community and shows it prominently with a green roof. This indicates that the green roof color is characteristic of the site within the neighborhood and the HPP staff has no objection to the applicants retaining this decorative element.