



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

TO: Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB)
FROM: Serena Bolliger, Historic Preservation Planner
DATE: July 6, 2023
SUBJECT: CoA 23-18, 3421 21st Avenue North, Maywood Local Historic District

Background Information

The *Maywood National Register Nomination* describes the dwelling at 3421 21st Avenue North as follows:

The three-bay-wide, brick dwelling rests on a solid American bond brick foundation. Likely of wood-frame construction with a brick veneer exterior, the building has a side-gable roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. It has a one-story, single-bay wood-frame portico on paired square posts, and six-over-six wood-sash windows. Windows feature rowlock sills and soldier-course lintels. Other notable features include a one-story porch on the west elevation, a molded wood cornice with gable-end returns, and a one-story wood-frame rear addition clad in vinyl siding.

Constructed circa 1933, the home is one of five documented Sears mail-order kit homes in the Maywood Local Historic District (LHD). It is most likely an example of the Wexford model, with floorplan 13337B.

In January 2022, the HALRB approved CoA 21-31 for the demolition of an existing 1980s-era rear addition and construction of a two-and-one-half-story rear addition with a center patio. In June 2022, the HALRB approved CoA 21-31A to scale back the initial project to only renovating the historic house and removing the 1980s-era addition.

In October 2022, the HALRB approved CoA 21-31B to reduce the size of two wood double-hung windows in the rear of the new non-contributing garage to smaller four-over-four SDL windows. The CoA amendment also requested the modification of three wooden basement windows on the north and east facades of the house from single-lite to three-lite SDL windows. In February 2023, the HALRB approved an amendment to the proposed doors on the dwelling and the garage (CoA 21-31C).

Proposal

The applicant is requesting to replace the existing fixed, louvered vinyl shutters on the front of the house with operable, raised-panel wooden shutters, and remove the remaining vinyl fixed shutters from the windows. The new shutters will be installed on black metal offset hinges, such that, when closed, they will fill the entire brick window opening. The closure to the wall will be an S-shaped black metal shutter dog.

DRC Review

The Design Review Committee (DRC) considered this application at its July 5, 2023, hybrid meeting. Mr. Dudka stated that it may have been possible to select different types of shutters as part of the Sears home selection process and believed that a different style of shutter could be appropriate here. Mr. Davis agreed. Mr. Wenchel said he believed that shutters were character-defining and that the applicants should consider retaining the louvered style. The DRC placed this item on the Discussion Agenda for the July 19, 2023, hybrid HALRB public hearing.

Recommendation

The Historic Preservation staff recommends approval of the subject application. Shutters are appropriate for houses of this time period, and both photos and renderings of the original home show that it had shutters. Wood is an appropriate material in the LHD, and operability is appropriate for shutters of this era. If the shutters were removed, the historic dwelling would not be damaged, which complies with Standard #10 of *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*:

New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Operable shutters will be a utilitarian, visually and historically appropriate improvement from non-operable shutters. While there are existing fixed shutters on one window on the west elevation (out of two windows) and on two-and-a-half windows of the original rear elevation (one window was tight against the 1980s addition and only one shutter was applied), they are vinyl and do not appear to be original to the home. Based on the rendering of the Sears home advertisement for this model, these shutters may not have originally been installed on the house, as only the shutters on the front two windows are rendered.