



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD  
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

## CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

**TO:** Historical Affairs and Landmark Review Board (HALRB)  
**FROM:** Serena Bolliger, Historic Preservation Planner  
**DATE:** June 12, 2023  
**SUBJECT:** CoA 23-13, 3210 23<sup>rd</sup> St. N., Maywood Local Historic District (LHD)

### **Background Information**

The *Maywood National Register Nomination* describes the contributing pre-1916 dwelling at 3210 23<sup>rd</sup> Street North as follows:

The two-bay-wide wood-frame dwelling rests on a solid brick parged foundation. It is clad in vinyl siding and has a front-gable roof sheathed in asphalt shingles. It has a one-story, three-bay, wood-frame shed-roof front porch on metal piers and one-over-one wood-sash windows. Window and door surrounds are aluminum. Other notable features include stone-facing on the first story underneath the porch, an aluminum box cornice, affixed simulated shutters on the front elevation, wide, overhanging eaves, and a single-cell addition to the east elevation.

Most recently, the HALRB approved a Certificate of Appropriateness (CoA) application in June 2014 to construct a rear addition (CoA 14-06). Previously, in June 2003, the HALRB approved a substantial modification to the front of the house, including the replacement of the front door and side basement door (CoA 03-12).

### **Proposal**

The applicant is requesting to replace the 2003 side basement door due to ongoing moisture-related deterioration and rot. The 2003 six-lite wooden door was custom made and has an inset board-and-batten panel. The replacement door would be a six-lite fiberglass door with two shaker panels. The proposed Therma-Tru brand “Fiber-Classic Mahogany” style door has simulated divided lite glazing with low-E glass.

### **Design Review Committee (DRC) Review**

The DRC considered this application at its June 7, 2023, meeting. Mr. Davis asked for confirmation that this was a non-historic door. Mr. Wenchel asked whether fiberglass doors had been approved in historic dwellings in the LHD in the past. Ms. Bolliger replied that she did not believe they had, but that fiberglass doors had been approved in non-historic portions of homes previously. Mr. Wenchel confirmed with the applicant that the fiberglass was smooth and not faux wood grain, as textured surfaces are not recommended in the LHD. Given that this project is for a replacement of a non-historic door, the DRC placed this item on the Consent Agenda for the June 21, 2023, HALRB hybrid public hearing.

## **Recommendation**

Staff does not typically recommend replacement of materials considered appropriate in the Maywood LHD, such as wood, with materials like fiberglass. Wooden doors are typical in Maywood, both for interior and exterior uses. The *Maywood Design Guidelines* (page G-23) only outline fiberglass doors as appropriate in sheds.

However, the basement door in question is not a historic door given that it was replaced in 2003. The current deteriorated condition of the door indicates that this specific location is not suited to wood, or not to the quality of wood that is currently used in door construction. The *Maywood Design Guidelines* do not list fiberglass as an inappropriate material in the LHD (Chapter 5: Exterior Renovation). This is a secondary door opening and not on the primary facade of the home. The proposed finish of the new door will be smooth and not textured, which is appropriate for composite materials. The size of the opening of the doorway will not change. Given that the material is not historic, this change meets the intent of Standard #9 of *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*:

Standard #9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

In June 2021, the HALRB approved the replacement of one wooden bathroom window in the addition of a contributing home in the LHD with an identical vinyl window in a shower (CoA 21-11) due to ongoing moisture issues. This was not a decision based on the desire to replace alone, but due to the ongoing humidity and ensuing rot affecting the site and the material. Evidence showed that wood was not appropriate in that location and that replacing wood in-kind would result in the same outcome in the future; therefore, a man-made composite material was approved for that site-specific installation. Given the deterioration apparent since 2003 in the subject application, this specific location may be appropriate for a similar action given that it is not on the building facade.