



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD  
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

## CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS STAFF REPORT

**To:** HALRB  
**From:** Serena Bolliger, Historic Preservation Planner  
**Date:** April 13, 2022  
**Subject:** 2204 North Kenmore Street, CoA 22-02, Maywood Local Historic District

### **Background Information**

The Colonial Revival dwelling at 2204 North Kenmore Street was built before 1912. The house is a contributing resource to the Maywood National Register Historic District and the *National Register Nomination Form* describes the house as follows:

The three-bay-wide, wood-frame dwelling rests on a solid parged foundation. It is clad in asbestos siding and has a side-gable roof sheathed in pressed metal shingles. It has a one-story, three-bay, wood-frame front porch on Tuscan columns and one-over-one wood-sash windows. Other notable features include two gable-roof dormers, wide, overhanging eaves and applied simulated louvered shutters to the front elevation.

The HALRB approved the following Certificates of Appropriateness (CoAs) for the dwelling:

1. CoA 15-16: demolition of an automobile garage built in 1943 located from the northwest corner of the main dwelling (September 2015);
2. CoA 15-17: partial demolition and construction of a two-story addition (November 2015);
3. CoA 15-17B: construction of four timber window wells and the relocation of the air conditioning units if required (June 2016);
4. CoA 20-26: preliminary approval to install a pool, patio, and pergola addition at the rear of the property and the construction of a shed in the rear yard (December 2020);
5. CoA 20-26A: final approval to add four planters, repositioning of fence and air conditioning unit, and additional changes to previously approved CoA to install a pool, patio, pergola with roof and grill area, and shed in rear property (February 2021); and
6. CoA 20-26B: amendment to previously approved application for a pool, rear patio and pergola, as the applicant no longer wished to install the shed or the pergola barbecue area but to instead install hardscaping, including a 6'-high wood fence, to replace the pergola solid wall, and install a small curb wall and a guard rail (July 2021).

### **Proposal**

The subject proposal is to replace fourteen (14) wood windows with new wood windows on the historic core of the contributing dwelling. This proposed project involves the in-kind replacement of ten (10) one-over-one, double-hung wood windows located on the first and second stories and the in-kind replacement of two (2) single casement wood windows located in the gable dormers, and two (2) two-by-four, double-casement wood windows located at the attic story. All the existing wood windows are visible from the public right-of-way. The property owner is requesting the in-kind window replacement for a variety of reasons, including the air drafts that create condensation during inclement weather, their susceptibility to

insect infestation, and their lack of energy efficiency when compared to modern standards. The Historic Preservation Program (HPP) staff could not ascertain whether the fourteen (14) windows date to the Period of Significance for the Maywood Historic District (1906-1941).

### **DRC Review**

The Design Review Committee (DRC) first considered this case at its February 2, 2022, virtual meeting. The applicant presented an overview of the proposal and a scope of work for the window replacement provided by Marvin Windows. The DRC requested that the HPP staff visit the property and provide a condition report of the existing windows because the condition of the windows was unknown. The DRC also requested that the property owner contact a window restoration company to provide other options beyond an in-kind replacement. The HPP staff conducted a window survey on February 10, 2022.

The application returned to the DRC at its March 2, 2022, virtual meeting. The property owners provided a summary of a discussion they had with Mozer Works, Inc., generally explaining what it would take to restore the existing windows. The HPP staff gave a summary of their recent window survey and explained that the windows were in good condition but needed maintenance and weatherproofing at a minimum. Recognizing that this request to replace the existing wood windows with in-kind replacements could create a precedent in the Maywood Local Historic District (LHD), the DRC recommended that this application be placed on the Discussion Agenda for the March 16, 2022, virtual HALRB public hearing.

The application returned to the DRC at its April 6, 2022, virtual meeting so that the DRC could confirm that the applicants had provided the additional measurements and information requested by the HALRB at the March public hearing. Mr. Wenchel stated that he believed the packet was complete and that the proposed windows were of good quality. The DRC members considered placing this item on the Consent Agenda for the April 20, 2022, virtual HALRB public hearing, but Mr. Davis recommended placing it on the Discussion Agenda instead since it had been widely discussed by the HALRB last month.

### **Recommendation**

In accordance with both HALRB precedent and the existing guidance in the *Maywood Design Guidelines* regarding window replacement, the HPP staff recommends denial of the subject application. Staff evaluated the windows during a site visit and found that they were in good and sufficient condition to be repaired. Staff recommends at a minimum to weatherproof, clean, and sand/paint the windows where needed. This process could be done on-site with a technical tune-up without having to send the windows to a restoration facility. Traditional zinc weatherstripping also could be installed onsite to reduce air infiltration and improve the operability of the windows. Since the windows cannot be proven to post-date the Period of Significance of the Maywood LHD, staff considers them to be historic material and thereby a character-defining feature of this contributing dwelling.

Therefore, the proposed in-kind replacement of the fourteen (14) wood windows does not meet the intent of Chapter 5: Exterior Renovation of the *Maywood Design Guidelines*, which requires historic windows to be repaired rather than replaced if repair is possible. Additionally, the proposal does not meet *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, codified as 36 CFR 67.7(b)(6), which states the following concerning the rehabilitation of historic features:

Standard #6: Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials.

If the HALRB disagrees with the staff recommendation and determines that it is appropriate to replace the windows in the subject property, this would be a major policy change and would potentially set a new precedent for the review of future window replacement projects in the Maywood LHD. Thus, if the



HISTORICAL AFFAIRS AND LANDMARK REVIEW BOARD  
ARLINGTON COUNTY, VIRGINIA

subject application is approved, staff further recommends that new language for the *Maywood Design Guidelines* be drafted then adopted by the HALRB at a future public hearing, in collaboration with the DRC and the Maywood Community Association, to address updated parameters for window replacements in both contributing and non-contributing dwellings (and potentially outbuildings) in the LHD. This is necessary to help clarify the requirements for future window replacements for applicants and to offer specific guidance to the HALRB and HPP staff when reviewing such requests.